

Elementary Research Guide (Grades Pre-K – 5)

College and Career Competency: *Empathy*

Definition:

Empathy is defined as the ability to relate to the perspective or feelings of another individual. Without empathy, individuals remain indifferent or dismissive towards others and may engage in antisocial behavior. Empathy provides a means for people to lead compassionate, and socially aware lives. In short, empathy can be defined as trying to understand others and then showing your understanding (Gaumer Erickson & Noonan, 2016).

Essential Components for Students:

1. Make efforts to understand others: their contexts, feelings, and behaviors.
2. Communicate your understanding of someone's personal situation.

Competency Sequence for Students:

These targets describe how students demonstrate competency knowledge at each grade cluster (Noonan & Gaumer Erickson, 2018). By the end of each grade cluster, each student:

	Empathy
Pre-K	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Interprets emotions in the facial expressions or behaviors of other people. • Identifies what kind of emotion(s) specific actions or responses might cause a person to feel. • Demonstrates helping behaviors when someone is hurt or sad. • Identifies and labels their own basic feelings and emotions.
K-2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Describes similarities and differences between themselves and others. • Demonstrates increased awareness of others' feelings and perspectives. • Defines feeling words that describe basic personal emotions in themselves and others. • Recognizes when someone needs help and offers help. • Interprets facial expressions and non-verbal cues of others. • Demonstrates basic listening strategies.
3-5	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Demonstrates listening strategies. • Describes meanings of various feeling words and pairs feeling words with scenarios imagining another's perspective. • Describes the importance of understanding perspective. • Demonstrates methods to understand a peer's perspective, such as asking questions. • Communicates in respectful ways when responding to different points of view.

Research:

- Empathy is connected to **self-awareness**. More specifically, students who are self-aware of their own personal characteristics, including strengths and weaknesses, can better empathize with others regarding differing traits and areas of improvement (Baron-Cohen, 2011; Brent & Millgate-Smith, 2008).

- When teachers display empathy towards their students, they model desirable behavior and improve the overall learning experience. Students typically derive trust and gain confidence when a culture of empathy is present in the classroom (Cooper, 2011).
- The 12-week Kindness curriculum (<https://centerhealthyminds.org/join-the-movement/sign-up-to-receive-the-kindness-curriculum>) is a preschool curriculum based on mindfulness that emphasizes empathy, gratitude, and sharing (Flook, Goldberg, Pinger, & Davidson, 2015). Teachers reported that participating children improved on “indicators of learning, social-emotional development, and health,” (p. 49) as well as in grades and social competence.
- Students who regularly interact with animals or care for their needs tend to show an increase in empathetic behavior and personal responsibility (Daly & Suggs, 2010; Hergovich, Monshi, Semmler, & Zieglmayer, 2002; Sprinkle, 2008). Classroom pets, for example, can consistently reinforce prosocial behavior, including empathy.
- Researchers (Jones, Greenberg, & Crowley, 2015) found statistically significant associations between social-emotional skills measured in kindergarten and young adult outcomes in domains that included employment and education. They conclude that measuring these skills early can help identify opportunities for early interventions to build these important skills.
- Akos (2000) recommends small group activities that help children better understand their own feelings and feelings of others to build empathetic skills. According to developmental psychology, children in grades K-3 experience empathy through emotional reactions and the ability to recognize different emotions. A curriculum and activities for younger children can be built around recognizing emotions in others and themselves.
- Enhancing children’s emotional understanding through a conversational intervention produced significant gains in empathy (Ornaghi, Brockmeier, & Grazzani, 2014). The intervention consisted of 15 one-hour small group (5-6 students, average age 7) sessions held twice a week where researchers guided discussions of the children’s experiences and thoughts about every day emotional life situations.
- In a study of first, second, and fifth graders, those who participated in service learning projects or other similar engagements had increased empathy in all groups, and for fifth graders, it also led to a raise in civic efficacy (Scott & Graham, 2015).
- *Roots of Empathy* is a program in which an infant and their parent/caregiver visit a class monthly and participate in lessons regarding emotions, caring for others, and infant development. A study on the impact of this program on children’s social-emotional competence that included 585 students in grades 4-7 found that those children who were given the monthly empathy training had “significantly increased prosocial behaviors” compared to those in the control groups (Schonert-Reichl, Smith, Zaidman-Zait, & Hertzman, 2011).

Assessments:

- *The Empathy Formative Questionnaire* (Gaumer Erickson, Soukup, Noonan, & McGurn, 2016) is a 15-item instrument that measures students’ proficiency in two essential components of empathy: making efforts to understand others’ contexts, feelings, behaviors, etc. and communicating that understanding. The *Empathy Formative Questionnaire* results can be used by both teachers and students to assess relative strengths and areas for improvement. Students are asked to rate themselves on each item using a five-point Likert-type scale (1=not very like me and 5=very like me); results are displayed on a 100-point scale. The results are automatically graphed for students once they complete the questionnaire, enabling them to immediately reflect on their results. Results are also available to the teacher for individual students and in aggregate. The questionnaire is currently being beta-tested with middle and high school

students; while it is written at a seventh-grade reading level per the Flesch-Kincaid readability score, it can be adapted for grades 1-5 as necessary. The following example items represent each of the two essential components:

- I try to see things from other people’s points of view. (Understand others)
- I say things like, “I can see why you feel that way.” (Communicate understanding)

Teachers can access the questionnaire by setting up an account through

<http://researchcollaborationsurveys.org> and following the instructions to launch a survey and administer it to students. Students (and teachers) can use individual questionnaire results to identify empathetic behaviors that students can focus on cultivating or strengthening.

- The Social Competence Scale – Teacher version (SCS-T; Conduct Problems Prevention Research Group, 1995) is an instrument consisting of 25 items regarding behaviors students display at school, completed by teachers using a five-point Likert scale.
 - The SCS-T (<https://fasttrackproject.org/techrept/s/sct/>) includes behaviors such as “Is a self-starter,” “Cooperates with peers without prompting (PRO/COM),” and “Copes well with failure” for teachers to rate.
 - A parent version of the SCS has been validated for use with preschool-age children (Gouley, Brotman, Huang, & Shrout, 2008).
 - The Prosocial-Communication Skills subscale of the SCS, which consists of 8 items, has been successfully administered to kindergarten students (Jones et al., 2015).
 - The outcome of the Social Competence Scale given to the kindergarten students was predictive in future success as measured in follow-up evaluations two decades later. The outcomes evaluated “broadly represented personal wellbeing, covering domains of education, employment, crime, substance use, and mental health” (Jones et al., 2015).
- The How I Feel in Different Situations (HIFDS; Feshbach, Caprara, Lo Coco, Pastorelli, & Manna, 1991, as cited in Ornaghi et al., 2014) scale can be used to measure empathy in children ages 6-12.
 - It consists of 12 items that measure the cognitive and affective facets of empathy using a four-point Likert scale (1=never true, 4=always true). Children and pre-adolescents self-rate statements like “I can sense how my friends feel from the way they behave” (cognitive) and “When somebody tells me a nice story, I feel as if the story is happening to me” (affective).

Instructional Practices:

- The executive director of the Center for Anti-bullying and Non-Violence developed the PEACE Curriculum, which are “supplementary Aggression Replacement Training materials” (Salmon, 2003). The main component of these materials is the empathy training. Teaching Empathy: The PEACE Curriculum (<https://search.proquest.com/docview/214194053?pq-origsite=gscholar>) provides a number of free lessons and practice areas for students of all ages. Lessons deal with empathetic gestures and appropriate responses to communication.
 - The Center for Anti-bullying and Non-Violence provides additional free lesson ideas for grades Pre-K-12 (<http://wecanco.org/resources/>), such as empathy, anger management, social skills, and character education monitoring forms.
- Dr. Gwen Dewar provides tips for teaching children the “different facets and degrees of empathy” (Dewar, 2009). The tips are based on current evidence-based research (available from <http://www.parentingscience.com/teaching-empathy-tips.html>), and include:
 - Provide children with the support they need to develop strong self-regulation skills,

- Help kids discover what they have in common with other people,
- Foster cognitive empathy through literature and role-playing, and
- Seize everyday opportunities to model and induce sympathetic feelings for other people.
- Teaching Tolerance (n.d.), a project of the Southern Poverty Law Center, offers educators a lesson on developing empathy. This is available in grade-appropriate lessons spanning Pre-K to grade 12 through the following links:
 - Grades K-2: “What is Empathy?” <https://www.tolerance.org/classroom-resources/tolerance-lessons/what-is-empathy>
 - Grades 3-5: “Understanding Empathy” <https://www.tolerance.org/classroom-resources/tolerance-lessons/understanding-empathy>
 - Grades 6-8: “Developing Empathy” <https://www.tolerance.org/classroom-resources/tolerance-lessons/developing-empathy>
 - Teaching Tolerance also offers a “Learning Plan Builder” at <https://www.tolerance.org/learning-plan/using-the-learning-plan-builder>. The plan allows you to select one or more grade levels and one or more Social Justice domains, as well as choose essential questions and topics to align with your instructional goals.

The website also includes specific examples of fostering empathy in the classroom through students’ involvement with animals (Wilson, 2014) at www.tolerance.org/blog/caring-plants-and-animals-fosters-empathy.
- Empathy in Education (Hunter, n.d.) has developed and compiled a range of K-12 resources for teaching empathy, including lessons involving multicultural literature and digital art. These resources are available at <http://www.empathyed.org/>. The lessons tie to the standards: Cultural literacy, historical literacy, reading (including literary response and analysis), and health.
- Two books/downloads providing conversational interventions for Pre-K-1, “The stories of Ciro and Beba: How to enhance conversation with toddlers on emotions” and “The stories of Jack and Theo: How to enhance conversation on mental-state terms through language games” can be found at <https://www.labpse.it/en/programmi-di-intervento/> (Ornaghi, Agliati, & Grazzani, 2014; Ornaghi & Grazzani, 2013).
- The Humane Society (2015) provides lesson plans for students in grades Pre-K-6 that use animals to teach core skills and values like empathy. The age-appropriate lessons are aligned with the National Education and Common Core Standards in science, math, language arts, health, and social studies. See http://www.humanesociety.org/parents_educators/lesson_plans_for_teachers.html for additional details.
 - “From Nose to Tail” provides lesson plans for students of each age group and teaches students about dog-related humane issues, and helps kids learn about character education concepts, such as compassion, responsibility, and empathy.
 - Other lesson plans teach the students about animal habitats, pet safety, ecosystems, and the animal trade industry.
 - Service-learning project ideas (and in some cases, opportunities) are also provided and teach students about working cooperatively, while practicing reading and budgeting skills.
- Multicultural lesson plans and resources for grades K-5 can be found at <http://artsedge.kennedy-center.org/educators/lessons/grade-band-collections/k-5> (John F. Kennedy Center for the Performing Arts, 2018). This is a free resource that can be searched by keyword (we recommend “tolerance” or “empathy” or “diversity”), or by age group.

- In the lesson “America, A Home for Every Culture,” (http://artsedge.kennedy-center.org/educators/lessons/grade-3-4/America_A_Home_for_Every_Culture), which is tailored to grades 3-4, students will reflect on other cultures and look at the mosaic that is American culture.
- Another lesson (http://artsedge.kennedy-center.org/educators/lessons/grade-3-4/Cultural_Holidays) teaches tolerance through a comparison of the artistic and cultural traditions of Halloween in America and El Día de los Muertos in Mexico.
- A third-grade teacher uses role play and moral dilemmas to help his students develop and strengthen empathy (Upright, 2002). A dilemma that he has used with his students (the flood story, p. 18) involves a young girl who ventures outside after a heavy rain and flooding. Her mother tells her to be careful and avoid water, but the girl sees a cat caught in the tree. She would have to cross water to rescue it. Students discuss what the girl should do and why.
- The 12 Week Kindness Curriculum, free after signing up on the site, (<https://centerhealthyminds.org/join-the-movement/sign-up-to-receive-the-kindness-curriculum>), is a twelve week program for Pre-K children that teaches them how to cultivate kindness.
 - The lessons are designed to be practiced twice a week, for 20 minutes. The 24 lessons are broken into eight “themes” - 1) mindful bodies and planting seeds of kindness, 2) I feel emotions on the inside, 3) how I feel on the inside shows on the outside, 4) taking care of strong emotions on the inside and outside, 5) calming and working out problems, 6) gratitude, 7) all people depend on each other and the earth, 8) gratitude and caring for our world and wrap-up.
 - The free download also contains links for teachers to prepare themselves for teaching the kindness curriculum.
- To prepare students for collaborations in a diverse world, The Ashoka Changemaker curriculum (<https://www.ashoka.org/en/focus/every-child-practicing-empathy>) includes the “Start Empathy Initiative” with an emphasis on teaching K-6th grade students the importance of empathy. The free resource materials are available for teachers, caregivers, youths, and school districts and can be searched by type, category, or keyword.
 - Teachers can start with a free toolkit (https://startempathy.org/wp-content/uploads/2015/10/StartEmpathy_Toolkit.pdf) that includes tool cards, an empathy roadmap, and detailed lessons that include information on when to give the lesson, how much time is needed, and the materials needed for each grade level.
- Diversity in education is an incredibly important component in fostering empathy in children. For help in finding diverse lessons, Multicultural Lesson Plans and Resources (<http://www.eds-resources.com/edmulticult.htm>) provides a clearinghouse of multicultural lesson plans and resources (Sass, n.d.).
 - Diversity Council Lesson Plans and Activities (https://startempathy.org/wp-content/uploads/2015/10/StartEmpathy_Toolkit.pdf) provides lesson plans by grade level.
 - The Museum of Tolerance (<http://www.museumoftolerance.com/site/c.tmL6KfNVLtH/b.5063231/>) provides free, downloadable teachers’ guides that explore topics (Common Core aligned for grades 3-12), such as the power of words and images, dynamics of discrimination, pursuit of democracy and diversity, and personal responsibility.

References

- Akos, P. (2000). Building empathic skills in elementary school children through group work. *Journal for Specialists in Group Work, 25*(2), 214-223. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01933920008411462>
- Baron-Cohen, S. (2011). *The science of evil: On empathy and the origins of cruelty*. New York, NY: Basic Books.
- Brent, M., & Millgate-Smith, C. (2008). *Working together: Linking skills and curriculum for adolescents with a language learning disability*. Camberwell, VIC: ACER Press.
- Conduct Problems Prevention Research Group (CPPRG). (1995). Psychometric properties of the social competence scale—teacher and parent ratings (FastTrack Project technical report). University Park, PA: Pennsylvania State University. Retrieved from <https://fasttrackproject.org/techrept/s/sct/>
- Cooper, B. (2011). *Empathy in education: Engagement, values and achievement*. London: Continuum International Publishing Group.
- Daly, B., & Suggs, S. (2010). Teachers' experiences with humane education and animals in the elementary classroom: Implications for empathy development. *Journal of Moral Education, 39*(1), 101-112. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03057240903528733>
- Dewar, G. (2009). *Teaching empathy: Evidence-based tips for fostering empathy in children*. Retrieved from <http://www.parentingscience.com/teaching-empathy-tips.html>
- Flook, L., Goldberg, S.B., Pinger, L., & Davidson, R.J. (2015). Promoting prosocial behavior and self-regulatory skills in preschool children through a mindfulness-based kindness curriculum. *Developmental Psychology, 51*(1), 44-51. <https://doi.org/10.1037/a0038256>
- Gaumer Erickson, A., & Noonan, P. (2016). *College and career competency (CCC) framework needs assessment*. Lawrence, KS: University of Kansas, Center for Research on Learning.
- Gaumer Erickson, A.S., Soukup, J.H., Noonan, P.M., & McGurn, L. (2016). Empathy questionnaire. Lawrence, KS: University of Kansas, Center for Research on Learning. Retrieved from <http://www.researchcollaborationsurveys.org/uploads/EmpathyQuestionnaireInfo.pdf>
- Gouley, K.K., Brotman, L.M., Huang, K-Y., & Shrout, P.E. (2008). Construct validation of the Social Competence Scale in preschool-age children. *Social Development, 17*(2), 380-398. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-9507.2007.00430.x>
- Hergovich, A., Monshi, B., Semmler, G., & Ziegelmayer, V. (2002). The effects of the presence of a dog in the classroom. *Anthrozoös, 15*(1), 37-50. <https://doi.org/10.2752/089279302786992775>
- Humane Society. (2015). *Lesson Plans for Teachers*. Retrieved from http://www.humanesociety.org/parents_educators/lesson_plans_for_teachers.html
- Hunter, K. (n.d.). What is empathy? *Empathy in Education*. Retrieved from http://www.empathyed.org/index.php?option=com_content&view=category&id=45&Itemid=61
- John F. Kennedy Center for the Performing Arts. (2018). ARTSEdge. Retrieved from <http://artsedge.kennedy-center.org>
- Jones, D.E., Greenberg, M., & Crowley, M. (2015). Early social-emotional functioning and public health: The relationship between kindergarten social competence and future wellness. *American Journal of Public Health, 105*(11), 2283-2290. <https://doi.org/10.2105/ajph.2015.302630>
- Noonan, P., & Gaumer Erickson, A. (2018). College and career competency sequence. Lawrence, KS: University of Kansas, Center for Research on Learning.
- Ornaghi, V., Agliati, A., & Grazzani, I. (2014). *The stories of Ciro and Beba: How to enhance conversation with toddlers on emotions*. Milan, Italy: Fronteretro.
- Ornaghi, V., & Grazzani, I. (2013). *The stories of Jack and Theo: How to enhance conversation on mental-state terms through language games*. Milan, Italy: Fronteretro.

- Ornaghi, V., Brockmeier, J., & Grazzani, I. (2014). Enhancing social cognition by training children in emotion understanding: A primary school study. *Journal of Experimental Child Psychology*, 119, 26-39. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jecp.2013.10.005>
- Salmon, S. (2003). Teaching empathy: The PEACE curriculum. *Reclaiming Children and Youth*, 12(3), 167-173. <https://search.proquest.com/docview/214194053?pq-origsite=gscholar>
- Sass, E.J. (n.d.). *Multicultural lesson plans and resources*. Retrieved from <http://www.eds-resources.com/edmulticult.htm>
- Schonert-Reichl, K.A., Smith, V., Zaidman-Zait, A., & Hertzman, C. (2011). Promoting children's prosocial behaviors in school: Impact of the "Roots of Empathy" program on the social and emotional competence of school-aged children. *School Mental Health*, 4(1), 1-21. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s12310-011-9064-7>
- Scott, K.E., & Graham, J.A. (2015). Service-Learning. *Journal of Experiential Education*, 38(4), 354-372. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1053825915592889>
- Sprinkle, J.E. (2008). Animals, empathy, and violence: Can animals be used to convey principles of prosocial behavior to children? *Youth Violence and Juvenile Justice*, 6(1), 47-58. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1541204007305525>
- Teaching Tolerance. (n.d.). *Developing empathy*. Retrieved from <http://www.tolerance.org/lesson/developing-empathy>
- Upright, R.L. (2002). To tell a tale: The use of moral dilemmas to increase empathy in the elementary school child. *Early Childhood Education Journal*, 30(1), 15-20. <https://doi.org/10.1023/a:1016585713774>
- Wilson, R.A. (2014). *Caring for plants and animals fosters empathy*. Retrieved from <http://www.tolerance.org/blog/caring-plants-and-animals-fosters-empathy>